|  |
| --- |
| CMPUT 401 – WINTER 2013 – University of Alberta |
| Requirements Technical Review |
| Findings Report |
| **3/1/2013** |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

**Reviewing Team #:** 5 (Biomembranes)

**Reviewer Names:**

Cameron Mann,Glen Nelson,

James Wang, Nick Klose,

Omar Qadri, and Richard Leung

**Authoring Team #:** 2 (EPL)

**Document Name:** Project Requirements Document

# Defects, Risk Areas, and Concerns

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Location | # | Severity | Discoverer | Description |
| Overview | 1 | High | **Cameron/** Omar/Nick | You mention the website will be built for the three most popular modern web browsers. However, a large portion (probably around 10%) of visitors to your website will be using other browsers such as Safari, Opera, and older versions of IE. Ensuring the website is fully accessible from other browsers is probably worth the time investment. |
| 2 | High | Glen | It sounds as if the EPL Game and Timemap have different accounts. If this is the case it would be very annoying. |
| 3 | Medium | Cameron | Are the general public and people interested in the EPL and Edmonton’s history really the same thing? |
| 4 | Low | Richard | “The EPL” vs. “EPL” |
| 5 | Low | Richard | …that “existed” at that time… |
| Requirements | 6 | High | **James/**Glen/ Cameron/Nick | TM. 1.1 is missing a step – there doesn’t seem to be any indication to the uploading user that their content has been rejected or approved. |
| 7 | High | **Cameron/** Omar/James | TM. 1.4: How is the ban enforced? What’s to stop the spammer from re-registering? |
| 8 | High | Glen | TM. 2.1: Why no captcha? It would decrease the amount of spam coming in and wouldn’t be difficult to add. |
| 9 | High | Nick | TM. 2.1: What restrictions are there on usernames and passwords? How long can they be? Are spaces and symbols allowed? Will there be a simple password strength check? What about security questions? Will the game opt-in option be checked by default? |
| 10 | High | Omar | HYQ. 2.5: For the post-registration option, what if the name differs? Also, there seems to be a lot of types of accounts and links between them in general. |
| 11 | High | **James/**Omar | TM. 2.6: Choice for text formats seems a bit limited, i.e. no formatted text type (e.g. rtf, doc, odt, markdown). |
| 12 | High | Nick | TM. 2.6: How large can the files be? Will there be any MIME checking or file validation? |
| 13 | High | Glen | TM. 3.2: Bookmobile pins aren’t defined, and it’s unclear whyt hey need to be displayed randomly about the map. How are they different than TimeMap Pins? |
| 14 | High | Glen | TM. 1.3 steps should be found and filled in ASAP. |
| 15 | High | Glen | HYQ. 1.1 is in an inconsistent format compared to say, the registration information earlier. This should be made consistent. |
| 16 | High | Omar | HYQ. 1.1: What exactly are quest streams & sets & types? There don't seem to be any user groups based on the previous information. What is the scale of point values (0-1, 0-100, arbitrary)? |
| 17 | High | Glen | HYQ 3 These requirements are all very inconsistent with previous requirements, and at times odd to read. HYQ 3.2 in particular is bad. |
| 18 | High | Omar | HYQ 3.3: will the book be the same for everyone? In that case, the waiting list might get quite long. |
| 19 | High | Omar | HYQ 3.5: So will the library have to give prizes to people who complete unlimited-time quests many years from now? |
| 20 | Medium | Omar | TM. 1.3: The usability data is not really relevant for this purpose. |
| 21 | Medium | Glen | HYQ. 2.5: Should be listed before HYQ. 2.2, as it gives a better sense of the prerequisites involved, instead of finding requirements later required for an earlier requirement. |
| 22 | Medium | Glen | TM. 1.5 seems like a poor way to do this, shouldn't you be able to simply navigate to stories you want featured and check a flag? |
| 23 | Medium | Omar/James | TM. 1.5: how does the admin know which stories correspond to which IDs? |
| 24 | Medium | Omar/ Cameron | TM. 1.6: what kind of notice will be shown to people who have already bookmarked that content? |
| 25 | Medium | Glen | TM. 2.3: If they login with a non-Time map account, will they have any access to the game? |
| 26 | Medium | Omar/Nick/ Cameron | TM. 2.3: are the accounts synchronized in some way? e.g. Can you do part of a quest through one account and the rest through a different type of account? Is the user allowed to connect their existing accounts to their social media? E.g. tying an existing EPL account to Facebook? Other sites have also offered the use of Google or Twitter as alternatives to Facebook. |
| 27 | Medium | James/Nick | Will there be a "forgot password" link? |
| 28 | Medium | Glen | TM. 2.5 lists an issue of ability to upload content anonymously, but earlier you listed an account was necessary to upload content (in the introduction). |
| 29 | Medium | Omar | TM. 2.5: Is external content copied over to internal storage? |
| 30 | Medium | James | TM. 2.5: How will the user be notified when their story content has been approved by an administrator? |
| 31 | Medium | Cameron | TM. 2.5: Can you edit uploaded content? |
| 32 | Medium | James | TM. 1.2: Have you considered the possibility of “publishing to this date?” Say the administrator uploads story content and wants the content only to be available to outside users on after Date X. |
| 33 | Medium | Glen | TM. 1.7: Again a settings file; shouldn’t this just be a database field? |
| 34 | Medium | Glen/James | TM. 2.2 has a “current password” field that can be edited, as well “new password” fields. Isn’t this confusing and redundant? |
| 35 | Medium | Cameron | TM. 2.2: Some sort of restriction on changing your username is usually common. Is it freely editable in this case? |
| 36 | Medium | Omar | TM. 2.4: Presumably they would have to be signed into their social media account. |
| 37 | Medium | Omar | TM. 3.2: Response time may be an issue (to add to the issues section). |
| 38 | Medium | Cameron | TM. 3.3: What happens if there is no featured content for the currently visible locations? |
| 39 | Medium | Glen | TM. 3.5: If there is random featured content, then I could see someone changing the date, seeing the content vanish, and then changing it back, expecting it to reappear - but it might not. |
| 40 | Medium | James | T.M 3.6: Who can add/change keywords? (The admin, the content uploaders?) Also how will keywords be determined and added? (ie. User Tagging System or database inverted index? |
| 41 | Medium | Nick | How exactly will the search work? Can users input multiple keywords? Can they use operators such as AND and OR, or enclosing multiple words in quotes? |
| 42 | Medium | Omar | TM. 3.11: Is there any search interface for the help? |
| 43 | Medium | Cameron | TM. 3.11: Is this general help or specific to the user’s view? |
| 44 | Medium | Cameron | Is there a notification system for users for when new quests are created? |
| 45 | Medium | Omar/James | HYQ. 2.2: What about users who signed in from the custom or Facebook account? |
| 46 | Medium | Omar/James | HY 2.3: The quest codes can easily be shared online with people who haven’t done the quest. |
| 47 | Medium | Omar | HYQ 2.4: This requirement may cause some complications (e.g. deleted content) |
| 48 | Medium | Glen/James | HYQ. 2.7: Timemap had integration with a larger number of social media applications. This reduced set seems like it would be jarring. |
| 49 | Medium | James | HYQ, 3.1-3.7: Does not state how quest activities and trivia will track for the Administrators. For instance most popular quests, least complete quest, individual user quest progress |
| 50 | Medium | Omar | HYQ 3.1: how is the system supposed to verify that a person has visited the location of an old branch? |
| 51 | Medium | Omar | HYQ 3.2: from what sources are these questions generated? |
| 52 | Medium | Omar | HYQ 3.4: What about the twitter interaction, or people without facebook accounts? |
| 53 | Medium | Omar | HYQ 3.7: What is the purpose of assigning quests to groups -- is this information ever used? |
| 54 | Low | Omar | TM. 3.4: Perhaps there should be some order to the placement so that it doesn’t change completely every time you visit it. |
| 55 | Low | Omar | TM. 3.8: So the content must necessarily be viewed inline? |
| 56 | Low | Richard/Glen | HYQ. 1.2: Lowercase medium, compared to the normally used “Medium”; should also indicate where the Administrator makes these changes, as in previous requirements. |
| 57 | Low | Omar | What sort of prizes (virtual or real)? If there are multiple prizes for a certain amount of points, do you get all of them or do you get to pick only one? |
| 58 | Low | Nick | HYQ. 2.3: Can the administrator change this code? |
| 59 | Low | Richard | HYQ. 2.6: …allowing the next one to be “viewed” once the… |
| 60 | Low | Glen | HYQ 3.5 to 3.7 seem to be actually administrative requirements related to quests. Why are they here? |
| 61 | Low | Omar | HYQ 1.1: (it's -> its), HYQ 2.4 (integration -> integrated), HYQ 2.6 (view -> viewed), SB 6 (model -> modal). |
| Intellectual Property | 62 | High | **James/**Glen/ Omar | Shouldn't you know what the license is by now? This does not seem like it should be blank. |
| Glossary | 63 | Low | Glen | Missing seems to be the various "pins" mentioned. |
| 64 | Low | Omar/Nick | You use the word "administrator" in your definition of "administrator", and similar issues exist with the other definitions. |
| 65 | Low | Omar | Quests, quest streams, sets and types. |
| Storyboard | 66 | High | Nick | 10 - I like the format of the logout button better here, but the My Account link seems to be missing. I'd recommend adding this and any other relevant links, and keeping this format consistent on all website pages. Users may get lost if access methods for these functions is context-dependent. |
| 67 | Medium | James | 10 has sound cloud embedding so does that mean some files will be potentially hosted externally from 3rd party sites? What happens when the file disappears? What about the rights? |
| 68 | Medium | Nick/Omar | 06: Not all login options are shown. It seems to just be a jumble of fields and buttons. I think you can make it more aesthetically pleasing. |
| 69 | Medium | Nick/Omar | 02: Users may have difficulty identifying that they need to click the gear icon at the top-right to manage their account, log out, etc. These links might be better placed in a persistent header. Also, it is not clear what the icon with two squares is supposed to do. |
| 70 | Medium | Richard | 02: Should mention "My Account" leads to #09 |
| 71 | Medium | Richard | 03 Might want to mention what the Captcha is. |
| 72 | Medium | Richard | Storyboard #5: ...as well as the "ability" to quickly...; Do the users choose what area to put their stories in? |
| 73 | Medium | Glen/Richard | 07 includes a Captcha, which doesn't appear in the requirements above. |
| 74 | Medium | Omar | 07: Not all login options are shown. |
| 75 | Low | Glen | The storyboard is supposed to be part of the requirements section of the document. |
| 76 | Low | Richard | Account management should only be accessible when logged into a created account. Description indicates otherwise. |
| 77 | Low | Nick | 14 - Will the user be able to later reactivate their account bby contacting the website admin after deleting it? |
| Resources | 78 | Low | James | In Similar Products Giantbomb.com has removed their quest system since their site relaunch on February 14, 2013. They have also switched to using the Symfony2 framework instead of Django. If you still need a reference, ComicVine.com, giantbomb’s sister website still has their quest system but they are also going through the same relaunching as giantbomb in the next couple of weeks. |

# Statistics

**Number of major findings:** 18

**Number of moderate findings:** 43

**Number of minor findings:** 17

**Person hours of review effort:** 13

(Nick: 5; James: 1; Omar: 2; Richard: 1; Glen: 3; Cameron: 1)